

November 19, 2019

Board Meeting

DOUG TISDALE: --19, 2019, RTD Board meeting. The record will reflect that we are convened as of 5:30 PM Mountain Standard Time. And I would respectfully at this time ask all of you, please, to silence your cell phones and other electronic devices so that they will not interfere with-- [CLEARS THROAT] excuse me-- the meeting. Please do recall, also, that this meeting is being recorded, both video and audio, for future posterity, I suppose.

At this time, I would ask you all please to rise and join with me in the recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance. I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America and to the republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all. Thank you very much. You may be seated. Ms. McManus, if you would please now call the role of the Directors.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Broom?

BOB BROOM: Present.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Buzek?

VINCE BUZEK: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Catlin.

PEGGY CATLIN: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Cook.

SHELLEY COOK: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Folska.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Present.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Guissinger?

LYNN GUISSINGER: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Lewis?

SHONTEL LEWIS: Present.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Lubow?

JUDY LUBOW: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Menten?

NATALIE MENTEN: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Mihalik?

KEN MIHALIK: I'm here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Rivera-Malpiede?

ANGIE RIVERA-MALPIEDE: Present.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Walker?

JEFF WALKER: Here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Director Whitmore?

TROY WHITMORE: Present.

DOUG TISDALE: Director Williams?

KATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. I'm here.

BARBARA MCMANUS: Chair Tisdale?

DOUG TISDALE: Present.

BARBARA MCMANUS: 15 present, 0 absent.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. Ladies and gentlemen, we have a safety briefing now. And we want to remind you that at RTD, safety is, in fact, our core value. So we'd like to remind you that if we have a medical emergency at any time during a meeting that would necessitate calling 911, I will ask our RTD legal counsel to make that telephone call. If there are any medically trained professionals in the room, you are respectfully requested to provide assistance.

Also, please note that if it is needed, there is an Automatic Emergency Defibrillator, and that's AED device, in a blast case that's located just outside this room. And it's on the wall to the right. In the event that we do have to evacuate this building due to any unforeseen circumstances or emergency, we ask you please to calmly exit out the door through which you entered and then go up the stairs and then go around the guard station and exit through the front door, where there will be people there to meet you and to guide you to a safe meet-up area.

If there is anyone who needs special assistance in the event of an evacuation, please let us know, and you will be assisted by RTD staff as necessary. There's a related security note that we keep talking about. But it surprises me how sometimes you can say something over and over and over, and people just don't hear it.

So we're going to say again that RTD takes every reasonable precaution to ensure the security and the safety of its passengers and everyone who is near our facilities. We want you to know, however, that we have to rely upon you, the public, our employees, our riding public, our visitors, to be aware of and to report any suspicious or dangerous activity on buses, on trains, at the stations, around the platforms. We encourage, therefore, all of you, please, to download on your phone the RTD Transit Watch app.

The Transit Watch app is available in your iTunes store for Apple iTunes, for Android in the Android Store. It is very easily loaded. And it provides safety and security to you, such that if you see something, say something. And remember, if you have the RTD Transit Watch app, you'll never ride alone. Thank you.

Now, we have five retirees that we will be honoring for the month of November. And I believe that two of them are with us here this evening. And I believe that Mr. Worthen is going to do the honors on these. Our first retiree is Marshall Barner-- Marshall Barner, who has been a Bus Operator with this agency for 18 years. And Marshall will now be introduced by our Assistant General Manager of Bus Operations, Mr. Fred Worthen. Mr. Worthen, if you please.

FRED WORTHEN: Thank you, sir. Fred Worthen, AGM of Bus Operations. I am lucky to have Mr. Marshall Barner join us tonight. Mr. Barner's situation is a little unique. He has been with RTD for 18 years. And he actually worked out of East Metro all 18 years.

Usually, somebody will bounce back and forth. He was lucky enough to get some place that was close to home, enjoyed it, and stayed there. We're joined by his better half, Sherry. Sherry, thank you for joining us.

And I'm already doing my recruitment efforts. I did talk to him about the retiree bus driver program. He said it's only been a month. It's too soon. But he'd think about it. So Sherry, when you get tired, send him back our way. But 18 years, thank you, sir.

MARSHALL BARNER: Thank you, sir. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

DOUG TISDALE: Here we go. Actually, stand right here in a line. David will be here next in line.

DOUG TISDALE: Congratulations. That's great.

MARSHALL BARNER: Thanks.

DOUG TISDALE: Good to have you here tonight.

[APPLAUSE]

We call again upon Mr. Wortham because our next retiree is Eugene Saavedra, a general repair mechanic in the bus operations division, who has also been with us for 18 years. Mr. Worthen, once again, sir, the floor is yours.

FRED WORTHEN: I apologize, Mr. Chair. I do not see Eugene present at this moment. I know he was confirmed to come. But he's not here yet.

DOUG TISDALE: Well, that's all right. We will honor Eugene Saavedra, general repair mechanic for 18 years, along with, let me ask, are there any other of the retirees who have joined us this evening? If you have, even if you didn't respond, you're welcome to come forward, and you will be introduced and acknowledged.

If not, let me take this time, then, to recognize-- [CLEARS THROAT] excuse me-- as I said, Eugene Saavedra, General Repair Mechanic, 18 years; Steven Jimmerson, a Transportation Supervisor in the Bus Operations department for 21 years; Joy Voltz, who's with the Paratransit Services Quality Assurance Group as a supervisor and has been there for 30 years; and Lupe Jones, who's been a Customer Care Supervisor for 41 years. Let's give it up for all of our retirees.

[APPLAUSE]

That is something of which agency can be justifiably proud is having employees stick with us for long periods of time through thick or thin, through good times and bad, through challenges and opportunities. It's a great experience to be able to honor and acknowledge this workforce. This is now our public participation period, which is open to anyone who wants to speak.

Now, as is our custom, we allow any of our elected officials present to speak first so that they can get back to their meetings and attend to business. If you have signed up to speak, I will call your name in the order in which you signed up. If you have not signed up and would like to speak, not to worry. We will ask for additional speakers at the end of the list. And we will take those additional speakers at that time.

Each speaker is allowed three minutes. Let me repeat that, three minutes. We respectfully request that members of the audience refrain from any indications of support or opposition to a speaker's comments, as such outbursts might reasonably have the effect of chilling the free expression of thoughts by our speakers.

Please also bear in mind that by appearing at that microphone at that podium, you are consenting to being video and audio recorded by RTD, as all of our meetings are recorded and made available on the RTD website. So if you do not wish to be recorded, you will then have to submit your comments in writing. So I'll ask you please to come to the lectern when your name is called. I'll ask you then to please state your name and your address. If you have any documentation or

reference materials you'd like to share with us, if you'd please hand them to the Board staff prior to speaking.

I have two people who have signed up. Let me first recognize Mr. Gary Van Dorn to come forward be recognized. Again, Mr. Van Dorn, if you would, name and address, and then you will have up to three minutes.

GARY VAN DORN: Good afternoon. Gary Van Dorn, 625 Pennsylvania-- is this on? Gary Van Dorn, 625 Pennsylvania Street, Denver, Colorado, 80203. My comments are going to be personal. Oh, it is now?

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

GARY VAN DORN: Do I get to start over? There we go. OK, Gary Van Dorn, 625 Pennsylvania Street, Denver, Colorado 80203. I had an idea something was wrong since my voice carries. I'm speaking for myself tonight. I'm not speaking on behalf of the National Federation of the Blind of Colorado. And I want to make that clear.

First of all, I am disquieted with the Board as an institution. Over time, since about 2012, you've known that the economy is improving, and that you've had to keep paces with operator wages. You've not done it. And the institution of a Board, not only does RTD need to be re-imagined, but so does this Board.

And we, the public, need to re-imagine it not by making it an appointed Board, but ensuring that you are definitely elected. And people out there in the public, you need to pay attention to who your members of this Board are. You need to hold them accountable for what RTD is now going through with this budget and the lack of operators.

So when you're on those platforms or your buses aren't there, this is the group that you need to send your emails to. This Board needs to make good use of the information presented by Leeds. After all, we do spend a lot of money for it.

Lastly, the National Federation of the Blind did meet in Fort Collins. And we did pass a resolution concerning the 16th Street Mall. We are concerned about the lack of curbs, and we are encouraging the city to have a delineation between the curbs and the transit way.

So once I receive the text of that resolution, I'll share it with the entire Board. And if you have questions, you're always welcome to contact me. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Mr. Van Dorn. We appreciate your taking the time to come and to speak with us. Before I recognize the next speaker who has signed up, we have now had one of our retirees come to the meeting after all, a few minutes late. We were proceeding at lightning pace. So don't feel bad about that, Mr. Saavedra. If I could now ask our Assistant General Manager for Bus Operations, Fred Worthen, to return to the podium, we can take a moment to honor Eugene Saavedra.

FRED WORTHEN: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Fred Worthen, AGM of bus ops. I am very pleased to present to you Mr. Eugene Saavedra. Now, Mr. Saavedra is a success story for us. He started out as a service person at East Metro and Platt. He transferred to light rail and worked for light rail and MOW for three years.

But he saw the error of his ways, and he returned back to operations. He applied as a mechanic helper, where he completed the 18-month program. Then he spent the last 11 years of his career as a general repair mechanic at Platt maintenance.

I'm just really proud of Mr. Saavedra, though, because he is the epitome of the heart of people, like the operator vehicle maintenance program. He worked his way through the ranks. He served in a helper program. And then he has been a very productive person for us.

I'm very sorry to see him leave, because we desperately need mechanics. But we have appreciated the 18 years you've given to us, sir. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

EUGENE SAAVEDRA: And I'm bringing my dad who isn't here and no longer on the planet. And my two daughters couldn't be here, and they're here in spirit. So I had to bring [INAUDIBLE] my dad. I really miss him. He would have been so proud to be here with me, a retired construction worker for 30 years in the union. And just he was the guy who taught me the difference between a box wrench and an open-end wrench.

[LAUGHTER]

[APPLAUSE]

I want to say I thank RTD for the opportunity it gave me. I came as a mechanic helper late in life. I was almost 50. I had a previous career in the health care field. And things didn't work out for me in personal life. And I had a second chance in life. And mechanics was something I had a lot of interest in it. And I was so glad to get the opportunity. So I'm thankful for RTD for teaching me how to repair cars.

[APPLAUSE]

DOUG TISDALE: Here, here. Thank you. Thank you very much Mr. Saavedra. Then I will call upon our second speaker who signed up, and that's Mr. Houston Elam. Houston Elam, if you would please come forward, and we'll ask you to state your name and give us your address. And then you will have up to three minutes.

HOUSTON ELAM: My name is Houston Elam. I live at 5897 South Louthan Street in Littleton. My nickname is Tex. I've been associated with RTD since about 2000-- 00. And as one example of my work, all this volunteer, all this no responsibility of yours, I was the recipient of your major award for service the first year it was offered.

The reason I'm here is that I responded to the two-question questionnaire by saying I disagreed and do disagree with the idea of removing some service on quote, "a temporary basis." To begin with, doing that, since the temporary basis will be at least two years, the upcoming year being an election year, and any president, especially this one, will do everything reasonable and some things perhaps less reasonable to keep the economy going, and therefore the problem that exists now will exist during that period and any period following. The difficulty that you have is obvious, and it is not easily solvable.

And that of course, is when you get creative. On the Board's part, folks, one of your responsibilities-- once you are elected, you're elected to represent a district. But once you become a member of the Board, then you take on the authority of being the ones responsible for all of the activities of this corporation and therefore of the citizens, us, who you need to provide adequate, successful service simply because it's the task that we, the taxpayers, have given you, the corporation, and you, the Board, to represent.

It is very difficult. It's awfully difficult. It's awfully difficult for management. Because what it means is that something has to change. It's not working now. You're not able to get the employees that you need. Therefore you're going to have to spend more money.

You don't have any money unless you make some changes. And those changes are going to be difficult because they're going to affect people, and they're going to affect the organization.

DOUG TISDALE: Mr. Elam, I'm going to ask you to wrap it up now, if you would, please.

HOUSTON ELAM: I will. Thank you. It's because of all of that, the fact that I'm 87, legally blind, came down here because I care. I care about you people. I care about the service we need. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to talk and to present the comment that I'm afraid if you follow through on that kind of reduction, that there will be consequences. That is the people who care about service and who need service, who have no alternatives, will get more involved in your business. And I don't want that to happen. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you, Mr. Elam. We appreciate that. And you had some very, very nice comments in there. And we very much appreciate your coming forward. Is there any other speaker who has not signed up who would like to come forward now and speak? All right. I will note for the sake of the record, people who are 87 can go over three minutes. People who are not under 87 are restricted to three minutes. If you would give us your name, your address, and then you will have up to three minute.

JULIE DURAN MULLICA: Sure. Yes. My name is Julie Duran Mullica. And my address is 1187 Elati Street in Northglenn, Colorado. So hi, everybody. My name is Julie Duran Mullica. And I'm a City Council Member for the City of Northglenn. I wanted to come tonight to speak in support of the Promotional Fare Pilot Program for the North Metro line.

First of all, I'd like to thank our representative, Vince Buzek, for championing this effort on behalf of not only the city of Northglenn, but the communities of the northern suburbs. I urge you to support the PFPP because this program will incentivize ridership and will help our

communities offset the consequences of having the last two stops of the N-Line be subject to a regional fare. Our communities continue to expand. And having a transit system that is affordable adds to the quality of life of our residents and is one tool we could use to decrease the crippling congestion that we all struggle with.

As you know, the N-Line was supposed to be open in 2018. And our community is still waiting patiently for that day to arrive. To say my community has distrust in RTD is an understatement. Frustration isn't a good enough word to describe how several cycles of local elected leaders have tried to advocate for equity on behalf of our residents, and our demands have been unanswered.

We have experienced time and time again how the executive leadership at RTD have brushed off the ideas and concerns from our community. We've had to deal with poor communication from this leadership team that has left our residents confused and our elected officials trying to fill the gaps. We're not as good as your staff, unfortunately.

This program is the start of mending that relationship. With the help of local electeds, our state representative, and our RTD director, we were able to find a solution that our community could celebrate. I understand that there are some of you who do not support this initiative. I ask you to consider not only how this benefits the taxpaying residents who will be using the N-Line, but also how this pilot sets the stage for what will be next in your communities as well.

We all want the same things here. We want a reliable and affordable public transit system that meets the needs of our communities. And I believe the PFPP is the step in the right direction not only for the users of the N-Line, but this will help steer the entire system towards greater equity for the metro region. This Board has the opportunity to make this happen tonight. So I applaud you all for stepping up to address equity issues and setting RTD on a new track to serve our communities. Thank you so much for your time.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, councilor. We appreciate your being here and thank you for taking the time. Are there any other speakers who would like to address the Board at this time? Hearing none, then, the public participation period is closed. And now we turn to the committee reports. Please note that the committee minutes were included in the Board packet, and I would ask now if there are any questions from any director relative to any of the committee reports? Director Lewis, you are recognized.

SHONTEL LEWIS: I just have a correction. Package page 19 for the minutes for November 12, 2019 at 5:30 PM as it pertains to the modeling on-call contract amendment, it shows that my vote was in support. But for this vote, if you all recall, I pulled this from the consent agenda, and my vote was not in support. And so let the record reflect that.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, so noted. Any other comments or questions. I'm sorry. Was that all? Any other comments or questions, then, associated with the committee reports? If not, then those committee reports, as amended here, will stand as submitted and become a part of the permanent record. And the committee reports are enumerated in the agenda to this meeting.

We turn, then, next to the General Manager Oversight and Performance Management update. We have Committee Chair Bob Broom with us this evening, who will, at this time, sir, please share with us any comments that you have regarding the General Manager Oversight and Performance Management Committee.

BOB BROOM: Thank you, Chair. I'd like to thank the Board for completing all the surveys in a timely manner so that we could conclude our work for the year. We met this afternoon from 3:00 to 5:00. And we have a follow-up meeting on December 3rd to conclude our business. And that's my report. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman. Are there any questions of the Chairman? Seeing none, I'd now like to turn to the approval of the Board meeting minutes of October 31, 2019. May I please have a motion to approve the minutes from the regular Board meeting of October 31st?

ANGIE RIVERA-MALPIEDE: So moved.

DOUG TISDALE: I have a motion from the Second Vice Chair. I have a second from Director Williams. Is there any discussion on that motion? Seeing--

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: Yes, question.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: I will be abstaining. I wasn't present.

DOUG TISDALE: All right, and you may vote, but you have indicated an intention to abstain. You are more than welcome to do so. Ms. McManus, do you want an electronic vote on this? Or can we do a-- we have an electronic vote. We are ready now. Director Second Vice Chair Rivera-Malpiede was the movant. And Director Williams was the second. They have voted. Now, if the rest of us will please vote.

By a vote of 14 in favor and 1 listed as no, which we take as an abstention from Director Folska, the minutes are approved. We turn, then, to the Chair's report. And I'll try to keep this very brief tonight. And let me emphasize again that to the extent that there have been activities in which any Director has participated, and we do not mention them, either during the course of the chair's report or the general manager's report, during new business, you are entitled and invited to share with us any events or activities that may not have been listed here.

So I will note that on November the 1st, the Asian Chamber of Commerce Annual Dinner and Gala was held at the Salon Real Event Center in Denver. I was fortunate to be able to attend that with General Manager and a number of SL team members. Directors Folska, Mihalik, and I attended the Denver South EDP annual luncheon held on Friday, November the 8th. Also, on November the 8th, First Chair Catlin and Treasurer Cook and Second Vice Chair Rivera-Malpiede attended the Veterans Day luncheon that was held at the RTD district shops. And we thank you very much for participating with that.

The 2019 American Indian Achievement Awards Gala was held on Saturday, November 9th. And Directors Folska and Lewis attended that event. And we are very pleased to report that this last Monday, November the 11th, Veterans Day, a class of approximately 50-- 5-0-- new bus and light rail vehicle operators and mechanics begin their orientation and training.

There are several upcoming events we'd like to bring to your attention. As a reminder, there are two additional studies that had been scheduled this year for the benefit of the Board. The first one is coming up this Thursday, two nights from now. Two nights from now, November 21 at 5:30 PM in this room, the Board will be assembled for purposes of having a Study Session concerning the results of the communications outreach, regarding the potential service reductions, as well as a further review of the budget, as has been requested.

Now, you will recall that the Board Office Executive Manager, Ms. McManus, has sent to you request for any questions that you have that you would like answered on Thursday. Let me repeat that. If you have any questions you would like answered on Thursday, please, please get them into the Board office now so that they may be addressed to the appropriate staff.

It really to be much preferred to simply showing up on Thursday and asking a question that you could have asked now, to give staff some time to prepare. So please, do get those questions, because Ms. McManus will be responsible for compiling and beginning the process of answering those questions through the capable finance staff. The second-- and I'm sorry. So those are the two things on this coming Thursday, two nights from now. This coming Thursday is the outreach results on operator shortage and budget discussions.

Then there will be a second Study Session that will be scheduled for Thursday, December 12. That's Thursday, December 12th. That will also be at 5:30 PM. That will also be here. That Study Session will be discussing the potential service reductions.

So you'll certainly want to be here for that. So to distinguish, the one on this Thursday is talking about operator shortage and the outreach that we've had concerning the operator shortage issue, also getting some information. The Board will hear what kind of outreach have we done, what kind of activities would happen.

Then on Thursday, December 12, we'll be discussing potential service reductions, some ideas that will be considered. No action will be taken at that time. The process will continue in terms of collecting information and in having potential proposals presented.

In addition to these studies sessions, staff will also host a workshop on fleet electrification. That will be held on December the 5th. It will be held here in our third-floor board conference room. The staff goes to great length to put together these timely, informational sessions that we have for the Board. So again, all of the directors are encouraged and most welcome to attend that meeting if, of course, you are available and your schedule allows. And that is at a time to be announced, which I will look to staff to see if we have from either Mr. McKay or Ms. McManus a time for the workshop on electrification on December the 5th. Perhaps General Manager is going to volunteer something here.

DAVID GENOVA: I show it on my calendar at 4:30.

DOUG TISDALE: 4:30 PM, going once, going twice. 4:30 PM, all right. Thank you. Thank you for the question-- very good question. General Manager Genova will deliver his 2019 discussion, giving sort of the assessment of where RTD stands, sort of a current snapshot. And that will be in just two weeks. It will be prior to the committee meetings that we have scheduled for Tuesday, December the 3rd. And I believe it's scheduled for the morning on December 3rd, Mr. General Manager, for that address by you?

DAVID GENOVA: Mr. Chair, so we're talking about what we typically, in years past have been state of the district. It's going to be more like a year in review for this year. Typically--

DOUG TISDALE: That's why I didn't use the words state of the district.

DAVID GENOVA: Typically we bring that in the first item in the evening, whatever we're having that evening. So we're tentatively looking right now at December 3rd, for that evening of December 3rd.

DOUG TISDALE: So the year-end review from the General Manager will be Tuesday, December 3rd at the commencement of our committee meetings. Thank you. Then on December the 6th, Mr. Genova will hold his annual General Manager's forum. And that's where all of the employees are gathered together. As Chair, I will appear there briefly, simply to welcome everyone and to introduce Mr. Genova.

The event will be held in the Studio Loft at the Ellie Caulkins Opera House at the Denver Center Performing Arts from 9:00 AM to 11:00 AM. In that session, the General Manager will recap the agency's highlights and challenges in 2019. He'll also speak to the vision for 2020 and beyond. Audience participation will be encouraged, by allowing all of the attendees to use their smartphones to participate in a Slido poll. So that will be something to create interaction.

And First Vice Chair Catlin and I will attend that event. I would encourage any other director who is available to attend because these are always very good opportunities to hear some of this information directly from the General Manager, who's usually out there talking with folks, and to have an opportunity to interact with our staff, with our employees directly, by being there and by letting them see you. That concludes the Chair's report. General Manager, do you have anything you would like to report to us this evening, sir?

DAVID GENOVA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And I have a brief report. And thank you for covering those upcoming activities and meetings and events. I think those are good summaries. So a few meetings to report on. In the last cycle between the last Board meeting, we had another FTA-RTD quarterly meeting. The quarterly meetings are typically to work through any of our grant-related projects, and provide FTA an update on all of those projects.

We had our annual employee awards on Thursday, October 31st. It's always a very exciting day to be able to recognize a wide variety of our employees, including salary, and represented for

their outstanding achievements. And most of those awards are nominated and selected by a group of their peers. So it's a very good day.

I've had a number of introduction meetings with some of the new Denver City Council members. And those continue to be ongoing, just a quick introduction with all of them. So they have all of my information and point of contact here with the staff at RTD. On November 5th, I attended the governor's transportation funding meeting. This was a morning meeting of, I would say, maybe about 100 various stakeholders.

They gave us indication that these kinds of transportation funding meetings were going to be ongoing, with future ones being scheduled over the next few months. This one was kind of broken into a couple of different pieces. One was hearing from legislative leadership on activities going on at the state capital and some of their viewpoints on transportation. There was a presentation by Front Range Rail and a few others.

I did another Reimagine RTD presentation with HNTB leadership on November 6th. We had a telephone town hall on November 6th, in which myself, I participated, along with our Chief Operating Officer Michael Ford, our Chief Safety and Security Officer, Mike Meader, and our Assistant General Manager of Communications, Pauletta Tonilas. And we had a really-- I thought was a really good town hall.

We probably reached about 4,000 people, with about an active of, oh, I'd say, over 700 people being active during the one-hour call. And it was very impressed. A lot of the people that had called and provided questions were patrons of the system. They knew quite a bit about RTD. And we had a very good exchange.

On November 7th, we had our last N-Line elected officials briefing. And as a result of that meeting, had some questions regarding the grade crossings and the staffing. So you may have noticed in the last N-Line elected officials bi-weekly update that I put out on Friday that I added a couple of diagrams there, a couple of what we call scatter charts, that show some of the grade crossing timings, just to give people an idea of some of the things that I talked about at the meeting, to give them a visual representation of that.

So we'll include those. I will include some latest information on those in the report every two weeks, and then also the staffing snapshot so everyone knows where we are on staffing for the project. Continue to have our weekly meetings with City and County of Denver Chief Projects Officer, Josh Laipply. And you might recall he replaced Diane Barrett. So we continue to work on those meetings and work through our high-level projects together.

We had a town hall call with a few state legislators on November 7th, received some very good feedback that, of course, we're incorporating into the information that will be summarized for the Board on Thursday night. We also had our Veterans Day luncheon on November 7th. And this is always a great event for employees.

They really look forward to gathering and not just being honored for their service, but being together with other veterans. And this is the second year that we've had an employee actually do

a veteran employee-- or an employee who was a former vet do the keynote address. So it was very good. It's kind of a new thing we've been doing. And it's been really well.

We had a citizens advisory committee meeting on November 13th, and I attended and spent quite a bit of time exchanging with the CAC, as well as members of senior leadership. And we went through a Reimagine RTD workshop with them. On November 14th, I attended a metro mayors caucus transportation committee meeting. And this, as you all know, meets regularly. But we were kind of invited or added to the agenda fairly late, kind of towards the last minute.

But we had a really good conversation in that meeting about regional transportation, regional transportation funding, and some possible ideas for future. So the next meeting on that is going to be December 13th, the next meeting of the metro mayors transportation committee. And we'll be in attendance there to talk about regional transportation.

We had our 2019 Senior-- I'm sorry, Leadership Academy integration panel on November 14th. And there was a few of us from the senior leadership team being able to respond to any kinds of questions that our Leadership Academy team members are having as they work towards graduation soon. And I would encourage-- I think that's one event coming up in December. I don't have the date in front of me. I'm going to say-- I'm sorry?

DOUG TISDALE: 12/12?

DAVID GENOVA: December 12th. And so that's where they'll do their presentations. I encourage, if you have an opportunity, to stop in. They do a really great job throughout the year. And their presentations are certainly well worth seeing them deliver personally.

I just want to make a correction, on my GM report, the APTA Board Executive Committee Workshop, I did not attend. I was ill and was not able to travel to the meeting. So I did not attend that. As the Chair mentioned, we have our two-part Study Session on Thursday night on outreach and then also on the budget.

We've had a lot of requests for information, a lot of questions. We're busily compiling as much information as we possibly can to be responsive to everything we've been asked for. I will be reviewing all of that information tomorrow morning at SLT. And we should be able to provide most of the information, I believe, will presenting to the Board hopefully by the close of business Wednesday or early Thursday. So you'll be able to have some time with it before this Study Session.

And then I just want to quickly introduce to you a gentlemen who is replacing John Thompson. So I saw him when I walked in tonight. I wasn't sure Doug was officially on board with us. But as I saw him in the audience, I asked him if he was OK if I introduced him tonight. So I'll ask him to stand up. And then I'll just say a few words about him, Doug Allen. Thank you.

Doug is-- he's most recently the CEO-- was most recently the CEO of the Virginia Railway Express. He's been a transit agency experience. He's worked at DART for many years and, I

think it was, Capital Metro, both down in Texas. He's highly active in APTA. He, I believe, is the Chair of the Commuter Rail Committee.

And so he brings a lot of great experience to the project. And he'll be serving in the Executive Project Director role for Denver Transit Partners. So more to come on Doug. But I thought since he was here, I'd take the opportunity of introducing the Board to Doug. Thanks, Doug, for joining us.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you, Doug. And may I say--

[APPLAUSE]

Mr. General Manager, and with the consent of the Board, if it would be appropriate for Doug to come forward and take just a moment to say hi. Presumably you don't have a lot of prepared remarks, so we don't worry about the three-minute rule. But please feel free to--

DOUG ALLEN: Well, as a seasoned veteran of many public meetings, I can always speak just from the cuff. But thank you so much for the warm welcome. I've known Dave and a number of his staff for many years. I have been in public transportation for 40 years, working at a Council of Governments. So I am very much steeped in regionalism, understand that's how transportation works.

I seek to be a very collaborative professional in working through issues. And I've been doing that my whole career, helped establish the Trinity Railway Express in Dallas and the Commuter Rail System in Austin, and then had a great opportunity in Virginia with the Virginia Railway Express. And I'm just very delighted to be here, very excited to be here, and look forward to working with all of you to deliver good service for you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. Thank you. Appreciate your being here.

[APPLAUSE]

Director Folska, you are recognized, ma'am.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. General Manager Genova, could you kindly go into a little more detail about the Front Range Rail and the alignment and where are you, like some real meaty detail?

DAVID GENOVA: Well, I know a little bit of information, seeing the presentation a couple of times. So they have a variety of different alignments they're looking at. They're kind of in their study phase right now, determining what might be the best alignment and things of that nature. But that's the phase of the project I know that they're in. Perhaps what I could do is have-- Bill Van Meter is a commissioner on that project. And perhaps I could have him give a prepared overview at our next committee meeting.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: I think that would be awesome. And I'd like to know sort of where it begins, where it ends, and how it's going to get funded--

DAVID GENOVA: That is still a big question.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: --how it's going to integrate to our system and that kind of thing. Thank you.

DAVID GENOVA: Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Folska. Director-- Madam Treasurer Cook, you are recognized.

SHELLEY COOK: Mr. Genova, thanks for including the scatter plots for the N-Line testing. Do we have any sense for how that compares to the G-Line at a similar point or no?

DAVID GENOVA: Well, interestingly enough, Henry Stoppolecamp showed me some updated scatter plots today that even look better than the two that were in the packet on the N-Line elected officials. So we actually-- of course, we've been able to learn from all the lessons learned, as this system has developed. And so I would say that we're progressing well. We've made a couple of those, what you might remember us talking about ACAF, Approach Condition Adjustment Factors. We've made a ACAF adjustments at most of the crossings.

There are a number that are looking fairly good. We still have some room for improvement on those. We're in the process of this last round of data of putting that together, summarizing that, and presenting it to the FRA to get our next round of approvals on the next couple of pieces of testing. So I would say-- it's hard for me, without having all the data sets in front of me to say exactly how they would compare. But I'd say that it's getting pretty close to similar for right now.

SHELLEY COOK: OK, great. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Madam Treasurer. Director Menten, you are recognized.

NATALIE MENTEN: Thank you. Dave, can you give me the update on the feds and the R-Line situation and with the head ways and requesting relief?

DAVID GENOVA: My understanding is we haven't heard back just yet

NATALIE MENTEN: OK.

DAVID GENOVA: Yeah. They said they'd take four to six weeks to respond. So we should hear soon.

NATALIE MENTEN: Before the end of the year, then?

DAVID GENOVA: Yes, that's our expectation, yes.

NATALIE MENTEN: OK. All right. Just for curiosity, if we were able to get that relief, would we be able to work that into a January service change?

DAVID GENOVA: Probably not, just because the January service change is complete and done and will be voted on very soon. But I am asking questions around service planning about, are there intermediate steps that we could take? Or would we have to coincide with a run board? So we're still working through some of those questions and details.

NATALIE MENTEN: OK. All right. Thanks, Dave.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Menten. Anything further, Mr. General Manager, you'd like to supplement at this time?

DAVID GENOVA: No, thank you, Mr. Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. I appreciate that. We all appreciate that, General Manager. The next item on our agenda is the unanimous consent portion of the agenda. These are action items for the evening. We have three items on the unanimous consent agenda. They are noted as agenda item 11 A, B, and C.

If anyone has a question or about any of these items or a change to them, please feel free to advise, and we will, of course, pull the item from the unanimous consent agenda. Otherwise, we can proceed with a motion to approve.

BOB BROOM: Move to approve the consent agenda.

DOUG TISDALE: There's a motion to approve from Director Broom. There's a second from Director Buzek. Is there any discussion on the motion to approve the unanimous consent agenda and the three items there on? Hearing none, if we would proceed to a vote. Director Broom was the movant. Director Buzek was the second. We're prepared to vote.

By a vote of 15 in favor and none opposed, that passes. Thank you very much. Ladies and gentlemen, we turn, then, to the next item on our agenda, which is the recommended action items. We have two recommended action items before us this evening. They are agenda items 12 actions D and E.

The first item is the Promotional Fare Pilot Program, referred to as the PFPP, for the North Metro line. It is recommended by Directors Buzek, Cook, Guissing, Lubow, Rivera-Malpiede, Whitmore, Williams, and Chair Tisdale at the Operations customer services committee meeting that the RTD Board of Directors authorized the General Manager to take all necessary steps to design and implement a Promotional Fare Pilot Program, the PFPP, and to deploy the first project in the program on the North Metro line, commencing from its opening date and continuing for a period of six months thereafter. This recommended action supports the following General Manager's goals, specifically to increase ridership. Is there a motion?

VINCE BUZEK: So moved.

DOUG TISDALE: I have a motion from Director Buzek. I have a second from Director Whitmore. Is there now discussion on the motion? Director Buzek, you are recognized.

VINCE BUZEK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I want to thank the honorable council member from Northglenn for her kind words. However, this was not just mine. This was a team effort by a lot of people on this Board and a lot of staff. I want to thank General Manager Genova. I want to thank our Board Office Manager Barbara McManus for her assistance as well. Chair Tisdale and Director Lubow, you guys were very helpful initially getting the ball rolling and the people that supported this, getting it out of committee. Council Members Whitmore, Guissinger, Williams, Cook, Folska, Rivera-Malpede, Broom, thank you all for getting this moving forward.

As I noted last time, we had a letter from the city of Golden, the mayor, on behalf of her entire city council, approving this. And we had a new letter on your places today. And I can summarize it. It's from the JCCTF, which was created by an IGA with DRCOG to support TIP programs, and they support the PFPP. So that's a lot of acronyms.

So this was the Jefferson County Collaborative Transportation Forum that was created as a formal committee of the Denver Regional Council of Governments. And they report to DRCOG. And they are in support of the Promotional Fare Pilot Program, letter signed by Jefferson County Commissioner, Libby Szabo, and another word of support from a district not affected. And also this is going to bring some great fare relief.

Not only is it going to be a tool by which we can measure the impact on fare reduction and ridership, but it's going to bring some fair relief to communities of color and economically challenged communities that reside in the Thornton and Northglenn area. So I appreciate that as well. And that's about all I have to say right now. Thanks.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Buzek. Mr. Secretary Walker, you are recognized.

JEFF WALKER: Thank you. I'm still not in favor of this proposal, although I will vote for it. I think there are better ways to measure fare reduction in the regional zone. Back in 2015, when we had a fair adjustment, we lowered all of the regional fares. I think that would be a good measure. I haven't gone back to look to see how the ridership fared in the regional zones and those areas. But I think that would be a good measure.

Six months, I think, is beyond the pale of a promotional fare. Two weeks, like we did with the G-Line, I can understand that. That seems promotional. But six months seems a little long. But like I said, I will support it because everyone I spoke to, not a scientific survey at all, but everyone I spoke to in the District D has supported it. They said try something.

There are letters of support from entities outside of the area directly affected by it. And so I'll honor their wishes. But I don't think that this is the way to get to the measurement that is alleged to be sought. That's it. Thanks.

DOUG TISDALE: Thanks very much, Mr. Secretary. We appreciate your comments. Director Whitmore, you are recognized.

TROY WHITMORE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I will be brief, more brief than I was last meeting. But I just want to say thanks to the Directors, my colleagues, especially Buzek and the Chair and my fellow North Director Judy for her word smithing and assistance on this matter. I just think this is the kind of innovation that our constituency is asking for.

And I think it's an innovative way a step in the right direction to restore, or at least build trust in our region, much to the points made by Councilor Mullica. I appreciate those greatly. So I hope that this can become a model, a pattern for use to address some of the factors that Director Walker has spoke about. So hopefully it's a great, successful model for the future. And thank you also to the staff for participating in the crafting of this measure. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you, Director Whitmore. Madam Vice Chair Catlin, you are recognized.

PEGGY CATLIN: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. I continue to have concerns about this for a number of reasons. One, I just find it difficult to compare ridership data against projected model data. And I'm also concerned about after the six-month period, taking something away.

And the third point I'd like to make is that in spite of the Jefferson County coalition, as well as the City of Golden expressing letters of support, I believe that some of that was based on a expectation that they'd be next. And we have no guarantee that this could be taken forward on another pilot project. So I continue to have some concerns. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Madam First Vice Chair. Director Lewis, you are recognized.

SHONTEL LEWIS: Thank you, Chair, I do appreciate the letters of support as well. And I appreciate you, Councilwoman, being here, who's also my Emerge sister, so thank you so much. My position has not changed, however. And I, like many directors, agree with the spirit of this proposal, as this signals RTD's willingness to be good partners and an opportunity to try something new.

I am in support of trying something new, especially when the old way, has not shown significant progress. I, like many directors, utilize our services and in that utilization, notice the different methods in which individuals pay their fares. Some riders have discount cards some Eco passes.

But the person I pay most attention to is the individual that boards the bus, stands at the fare box, and proceeds to empty their pockets of change to pay their fare. This is the person I think about when we discuss a benefit, which the Promotional Fare would be a benefit to regional riders, to the exclusion of local riders. I am speaking particularly from the lens of equity and what I know about Title VI.

I am no expert, nor am I an attorney. I, as many of you know, previously worked in the agency in transit equity, specifically in Title VI. And as a reminder, it states, and I read this verbatim, "no person in the United States shall, on the ground of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefit of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving federal financial assistance."

The Promotional Fare Pilot Program, also effectually known as the PFPP, is, in fact, a benefit as it is currently written. This benefits our regional riders, to the exclusion of our local riders, to achieve the goal of increased ridership. As it stands and should be noted, that we have some of the highest local fares and some of the lowest regional fares.

As the current Civil Rights Chair, I lean on the side of caution, particularly when we have not properly explored the implications with an equity analysis. I must call out that an equity analysis is based on ridership analyses, of fare utilization, not demographics of residents. For me, this begs more questions than answers. With an equity analysis, staff could bring forth a version with the proper analyses.

I'm duly concerned about what happens after the six months. We now ask those riders who may have experienced the promotional benefit to change their behaviors and spending habits and then do what? A PR nightmare. I cannot support a measure that is to the exclusion of many of my constituents.

Speaking of constituents, as a Director, I do not feel equipped to answer to or respond in the event that I am questioned by a constituent about why they were excluded from this benefit. Again, I would appreciate a version of this for which staff brought back a fair analyses, which I recognize I won't get. I hope we remember that as our legislation states, we are here to support the poor and transit dependent, full stop.

I am committed to working with my fellow Board members on regional affairs. We share the same concerns. Unfortunately, I can not accept this proposal, as I believe it violates both Title VI and the spirit of what regional transit planning should be. Thank you, Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Lewis. We appreciate your comments. Madam Treasurer, Director Cook, you are recognized.

SHELLEY COOK: Thank you, Chair. Just regarding the expectations of, as I understand it, the west area entities that have expressed support, I think, at least in my discussions, for example, with Mayor Sloan, I believe it was clear that we weren't guaranteeing, for example, that there would be a subsequent. But we state explicitly that this could serve as a template, that it gets the desire of those of us who are involved in bringing this forward that we might be able to. And we certainly want to explore that possibility as we get into the first one. But I think it was also just a display of regionalism, that I really felt proud about. So anyway, thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Madam Treasurer. Director Mihalik, you are recognized.

KEN MIHALIK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. And as I said, I guess it was just a week ago, I do appreciate the innovative approach of this program. However, like Dr. Catlin said and some others had said previously that I'm concerned about the legitimacy of the results. And so I don't know that we're going to get the data validity that we would otherwise want and that I guess if you're wanting really legitimate data, doing this program on an established line, I think, would give you better data. Thanks.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Mihalik. We appreciate that. Director Menten, you are recognized.

NATALIE MENTEN: Thank you. Yes. Same concerns-- we don't have any measurements from this line, so it's hard to measure. But what it does state in here is that we will use good faith, reasonable estimates of ridership. What are those numbers? Anybody can answer, I guess.

DOUG TISDALE: I'm sorry, Director Menten. Is this pop quiz time now?

NATALIE MENTEN: If you would like to go with it, yes. Otherwise, staff could answer what is-- it's in the document. What is our good faith, reasonable estimate of ridership for the North Line, and would the answer today in any way change as we get closer to the line? How will we measure it? We don't have any historical measurement. Document says good faith, reasonable estimate.

DOUG TISDALE: I hear the question. And I think the question to General Manager, as you sit here now, without benefit of any materials in front of you and without benefit of having been advised that the question would be asked, which, of course, would have been easy to do, do you have knowledge or information available, either yourself or staff, in response to the question of Director Menten?

DAVID GENOVA: I don't have the ridership estimate off the top of my head. I'll look to Bill Van Meter. And if he doesn't, we can provide that to the Board later.

BILL VAN METER: This is Bill Van Meter, Assistant General Manager of Planning. The opening day forecast was 9,100 average weekday riders for the line. I don't leave the station-by-station numbers memorized. But certainly they are available, and that would be the basis upon which we could compare actuals versus projected. And then, of course, our expectation would be to do the after study when the fares return at the end of the six-month period. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Mr. Van Meter. We appreciate that. Director Menten, did you have any other questions you wanted to spring now? Or are you--

NATALIE MENTEN: Yeah, I do have some more I'll spring. Titles VI, when do we believe we would be able to cover that analysis? Just, this will get a lot of publicity. And then we have Title VI come back and say, we got some problems, I'm just wondering what kind of timeline we might have?

DAVID GENOVA: Well, the way the current resolution is written, considering doing a six-month promotional fare on the N-Line, and under current federal guidance, we don't believe we'd have to do a Title VI analysis just for this six-month promotional fare. Now, if we wanted to look at extending it or doing it somewhere else, then staff would recommend that we would do Title VI analysis. But that would be subject to future discussion on the Board for future activities on this.

NATALIE MENTEN: OK. And then with this plan, with the dollar amount that's in here, going of memory on this, \$180,000 or something, that would be good advertisement to the riders this is a promotional temporary price. Do you think that would be--

DAVID GENOVA: I'm sorry. Are you asking me to add marketing or promoting that it would be a promotional fare at the time?

NATALIE MENTEN: Yeah, so disclosure, so that the constituents are not caught off guard when-- I mean, I've heard already referenced Representative Mullica state in the newscast that his town was basically-- I can't think of his exact words. But it's sort of the same thing I've heard from Golden, that they were-- what's the word I'm trying-- that they were narrowed down. They were picked on, basically, and the rates were driven up specifically for that area, which is not the case because there's, what, 21 or some regional stations or 31.

I just want to make sure that the disclosure to the constituents is very clear that it's a promotional price. And they don't come back and go, all of a sudden, where did the price go now? You're charging me something. So it's more of a request to cover ourselves, cover future Boards and say, Mr. Rider, Mrs. Rider, whatever, there was no promise this was forever. That's all I'm trying to ask. So that's it, then. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Menten. Director Guissing, you're recognized.

LYNN GUISSINGER: Thank you. I think this is a great way to kick off. 9,100 is a big starting number, I think. And this promotional fare should help to launch ridership. And as Mr. Van Meter said, we can always measure it against the after ridership. And it actually would be an interesting way to measure it. So I will be supporting this.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director. Director Williams, you are recognized

KATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. And I'd like to speak to a couple of things that have already been said. We all appreciate Director Lewis and her efforts that she makes in an equity and Title VI. But I object to her use of the term "my" constituents because we are the Regional Transportation District, and they are all of our constituents. And we all are hoping to have the same concern for the people who live in this district.

I think that Director Cook pointed that out when she said that this is a regional effort. And that's how we are looking at it. I'd like to remind Director Walker that we did finish recently the 61 AV pilot. And I believe it was six months and that this is a pilot, which is where I think the six

months comes from under the FTA exclusion that we got. So I just wanted to address all those comments and say that I am still in favor of this new, novel, and different idea that hopefully will benefit all of the RTD district. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Williams. It is my opinion that was a good comment. Director Folska, you're recognized.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. I think if you don't try, you don't know. To me, what this signals is our staff, our senior leadership and our General Manager's willingness to say thank you very much, Board members, for your insightful input. We are willing to take this risk with you. And we recognize the needs and so on and so forth.

So it seems to me, if you don't use it, you'll lose it. If it's wildly successful because people are really using it, then maybe it's just something that we should replicate throughout the district. And maybe that is solving our problems. But we don't know anything if we don't try.

And so I think we're in a position where we need to experiment or not. Use it or maybe-- New Hampshire's like, live free or die. That's their motto. I knew it was coming. So yeah, and I think we need to give it a go because things are pretty grim for us right now. So I'm very optimistic, and I thank everyone who participated in putting this together. And I'll support it.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Folska. Madam Second Vice Chair, you are recognized.

ANGIE RIVERA-MALPIEDE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. After listening to everybody talk, I'd like to say a few things. I am in true support of this pilot for several reasons, for regionalism, for Reimagine RTD, for thinking out of the box, in light of gentrification, of the Latino community that are being pushed out the furthest is one population and will be able to utilize this service. It will be a true gift to my community. But in light of all of that, I think in terms of really looking at innovation in the way that we can serve community in a different methodology, of which they've asked us to do, this is a great step in the direction that we want to go. And coming out of the chute with a 9,100-a-day population, I think, is pretty damn good. Thanks.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Madam Second Vice Chair. Director Lewis, one more bite at the apple.

SHONTEL LEWIS: Thank you, Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: But if nothing else, you get a right of reply after Director Williams' comment.

SHONTEL LEWIS: That's exactly right. It's exactly right. She's too far away. Director Williams, I adore you. I appreciate you. And I agree with you. They are all of our constituents. And in the future, I will correct my language around that.

And you are correct in saying that we are a Regional Transportation District. And I would be in support of this, or at least I would move closer, if we were looking at local fares and regional

fares. But we are not, and I would be in support of this if we were. And that's where my concerns come with the Title VI. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Lewis. Director Broom, you are recognized.

BOB BROOM: Thank you, Chair, I support this because I think it's worth taking a look at. But on the other hand, I think our fare system is far too complicated. And this idea of having regional fares and local fares is kind of bothering because all these people live in the district. So they're all district patrons.

Why should everybody in Denver have a local fare without exception, and other people in the district have to pay additional fares? It just doesn't make sense to me. They all pay the 1% sales tax, and we're all in the same boat together. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Broom. Any other Directors who wish to comment in at this time? I would like to say that I appreciate very much the expression of support for staff and for the participation of the General Manager in this process that has been expressed by Director Buzek and others.

The General Manager went out on a limb. The General Manager took a risk. The General Manager pursued it diligently. That's what influenced my vote. I joined in helping to craft this resolution, coming up with the short name and so forth, because I wanted a dialogue. But I wasn't convinced it was a good idea.

What changed my vote, what convinced me to vote for it was the fact that the General Manager stepped to the plate and was a great advocate. Let the word go forth from this place, this would not have happened without the General Manager's participation and encouragement. That is perhaps misunderstood by some.

It is a clear-and-present fact that without the General Manager, it wouldn't have happened because it couldn't have gotten through staff. And it would not have had my support, and it would not have had the support of other directors here. It would not have happened. So I appreciate that. And I expect that to be understood as a central part of the record.

Anyone wish to make a comment in light of the Chair's comments that I have added at this time? Hearing none, then Director Buzek was the movant. Director Whitmore was the second, if you would all please vote following theirs. By a vote of 11 in favor and 4 opposed, the motion passes. The no votes were cast by First Vice Chair Catlin, Director Lewis, Director Menten, and Director Mihalik. The other boats yes. I thank you very much. That concludes our discussion on that agenda item 12D for the PFPP.

We turn, then, next to the final recommended action on our agenda-- goodnight, whoever just signed off-- final recommended action on our agenda, which is action E. This is the adoption of the 2020 performance measures. It is recommended by the financial administration audit committee that the Board of Directors adopt the attached, included in the packet, 2020 proposed

performance report and the accompanying performance measures for mission statement goals one through seven.

In 2020, there are 42 proposed performance measures to be tracked for the General Manager, which is one higher than for the current year, 2019. This recommended action supports the following General Manager's goals, core goal number one, successful delivery of transit service. May I have a motion to approve?

SHELLEY COOK: So moved.

DOUG TISDALE: I have a motion from the Treasurer. Is there a second to the motion? And Director Mihalik gives the second. And so we are now ready for discussion. Let me acknowledge and recognize our First Vice Chair Catlin.

PEGGY CATLIN: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. I am a little bit concerned going forward that these performance measures will be achievable in light of the fact that we may be reducing service in 2020 and that there are some of those measures that simply could not be attained. And I'm just very concerned about not being able to meet the goals as they're currently proposed to be measured. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. And I would inquire whether the staff would like to respond to that comment at all from First Vice Chair relative to the fact that should there be changes that these goals, as stated, may not be able to be achieved? And perhaps First Vice Chair would like to supplement now.

PEGGY CATLIN: I'll wait for an answer first.

DAVID GENOVA: OK. Thank you, Mr. Chair. We really haven't had that discussion at the staff level. I'm thinking-- I don't know if you had any-- First Vice Chair Catlin, I don't know if you had any particular ones in mind or not. But I'm trying to think, just quickly here, which ones might be impacted. Nothing's really coming to my mind. I guess I could say that--

PEGGY CATLIN: Perhaps ridership.

DAVID GENOVA: Well, yes, that's a-- well, that's a good observation, yes. Yes, that one wasn't-- I was thinking more of the service delivery, on-time performance, those kinds of things. But we've not had that discussion in terms of that. I would say that these could always be adjusted later by the Board. But that'd have to go through the Board approval process.

PEGGY CATLIN: You anticipated my next question, which was, if upon staff considering some of these performance measures in light of potential service reductions, when we know what that plan is going forward, could we then take another look at these and make some adjustments? Because, in all fairness, I don't think it's fair for you and your staff to try and achieve a goal that may not be attainable under those circumstances.

DAVID GENOVA: Mr. Chair?

DOUG TISDALE: General Manager, if you could respond. And just for the sake of the record and for the benefit of the other directors, if you look at packet page 67-- packet page 6-7-- that's page 6-7 in the Discussion portion, the discussion here is focused on Goal 6.2, which is increase in ridership. And the recommendation being that the ridership increase for 2020 be established at 2.1%. And that is the issue that is being discussed by First Vice Chair and General Manager. General Manager, please, you are recognized.

DAVID GENOVA: Thank you. Well, let me just say I appreciate the observation very much. Thank you. We have lots of volume pushing through. And maybe it's something we haven't thought about. But we appreciate the thoughtfulness around that.

I think what I would propose is that we keep all the performance measures in mind. I would suggest perhaps the Board could move through with adopting them tonight. And as we move through our work on this, and if we do bring forward, or that's the Board's desire to look at a temporary service reduction, we could look at which ones of the measures that we feel might be impacted and bring that to the Board at the same time.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, General Manager. Thank you, Madam First Vice Chair. Director Menten, you are recognized.

NATALIE MENTEN: Thank you. I would like to second what Director Catlin is saying, and in specifics, goals 6.2 and 6.3. Both potentially would be affected. So that would be the ridership question and also fare revenue, which if there are any service reductions, of course, could be reflected in that. So if that is what you had preferred, General Manager, I was going to vote yes anyway. But if you want to bring it back, please feel free to do that. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you, Director. We appreciate your comment there. Director Broom, you are recognized.

BOB BROOM: Thank you, Chair. What we're talking about here are goals. These aren't contractual requirements placed upon the district. If you miss a goal, you miss a goal, and then you explain why you missed it. And you don't want to set goals so low all the way across the board that there's no way you're going to ever miss hitting a goal. So we should keep that in mind. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Broom. Are there any other directors who wish to speak to the adoption of the 2020 performance measures? If not, we have a motion by Treasurer Cook, a second by Director Mihalik. Would all those in favor, please now vote, since they have now cast their votes. By a vote of 15 in favor and none opposed, this matter passes unanimously. So we thank you all for your cooperation on that.

We turn next to old business. Is there any old business to come before the Board at this time? Director Folska, you are recognized for the purpose of old business.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Thank you, Chair. Two things, Mr. Genova, we've been talking at least for seven years now, and it's nearly the end of the seventh year for me, about having all of our media

that's audible on the trains and buses in English and Spanish. And I'm not aware that we have that ubiquitously through our district. Can you explain why that is?

DOUG TISDALE: Mr. General Manager, if you can respond to the question at this time, please attempt to do so. You, of course, are not obligated because you didn't know that question was coming. We can deal with it later. But go on ahead if you have an answer.

DAVID GENOVA: Thank you. I would suggest let me do some research on that, and we'll try to respond by the end of this week or sometime next week.

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Well, that's fine. I think it's important. And I think that's part of the outreach and engagement that people know we really want you to be heard. We want to hear you, right? And we have a lot of Spanish-speaking people in our district, and I think that-- I love listening to it anywhere when I go to different airports. And LA Metro's got it everywhere. It seems kind of easy and straight-- I know there's technical stuff but pretty doable.

On another note, I did attend the Rocky Mountain Indian Chamber of Commerce on the 9th, and what a spectacular event. And I would encourage staff to go. I know Zamy was there. We had some other people. Did you get the award, Mr. Genova?

DAVID GENOVA: I haven't seen it yet. But I'll check with Zamy

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: Well, you can chase Zamy down for it. But it's pretty lovely. And I hope that we continue to support them. The money that they raise at this event goes to scholarships of indigenous people here. And something I learned. I think this is correct.

And if somebody can say I'm wrong, I stand corrected. But I thought this was an amazing bit of information. 2% of the American population is Native American indigenous peoples, and yet they represent the largest group of people in the United States military. Is that crazy? I mean, who knew? Anyway-- huh? Am I wrong? I could be wrong. That's what I think I heard.

So anyway, correct me if I'm wrong. And otherwise, it was really fantastic. Oh, and one more thing, I had the pleasure of speaking to a group of engineers, civil engineers. And these were the most-- there were, like, 25 of them. And they were so passionate and excited about sidewalks and curb cuts. I can't tell you how great it made me feel. They live and breathe that stuff all day long. So anyway, that was a good time. Thank you very much.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much Director Folska. And I'm sure there are fact-checking Googlistas out there right now, confirming the numbers about the Native American enrollment. Madam Vice Chair Caitlin, you are recognized.

PEGGY CATLIN: Thanks, Chair Tisdale. As a civil engineer, I'm not going to admit to being passionate about sidewalks and curb cuts, but to each his own. I wanted to say that I took my turn handing out surveys and taking surveys out at the Southwest Plaza park and ride. And I know Director Williams did, as well as other directors. And it was a really-- it was a great

opportunity for me to have discussions with operators of the buses and some of their ideas. And we passed out surveys so that some of them could take it as well.

And then just some incredibly knowledgeable people about our system that had been long-term riders that took part in the survey, and it was just a very rewarding couple hours for me. So just wanted to make note of that. Oh, and then one more thing, I'm speaking to a transportation symposium tomorrow on transportation along State Highway 285, in particular. So it's multi-modal. It'll be CDOT, as well as others.

And I got some great information from Mike Menter-- or Mike-- who is it? Meader. No, not Mike Meader. I don't remember. I got some great information from staff-- sorry I'm having a senior moment-- about some of the history along 285 and the transit that has been provided throughout history. And it was just really an education for me. So I will be presenting that tomorrow. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Madam Vice Chair. [CLEARS THROAT] Excuse me. Is there any other old business? We actually have slopped over into new business because it's new business where you bring up things that haven't been mentioned before. Old business is if there's anything pending that you would like to address. So on old business-- so this is old business, I will now close old business.

I will now move to new business on the agenda. And in the new business discussion, I will recognize first Director Menten.

NATALIE MENTEN: So I'm like a 50-50 here.

[LAUGHTER]

So I also did the survey. Are you talking about Dave Menter?

PEGGY CATLIN: Yes, thank you.

NATALIE MENTEN: OK, but 285, yeah. He's leaving us, by the way, I think. Yeah. Anyway.

SHELLEY COOK: He is, unfortunately.

NATALIE MENTEN: Yeah. So going back to-- I've continued to do more of the surveying and then got to just handing out flyers because Sunday it closed. And boy, what a rush. You need like octopus hands to hand out flyers when people are flooding at you off the West Line, Wadsworth Station. So that's good. It speaks to ridership, right?

So this is where it goes now to the new business, even though we talked about it before. But tomorrow night I'll be holding a community meeting at Golden Library from 6:00 to 7:30 PM. And then Saturday will be the Lakewood Library from 3:00 to 4:30 PM. So I hope between different avenues, including getting centerfold in the newspaper-- yeah.

[INTERPOSING VOICES]

[LAUGHTER]

NATALIE MENTEN: I don't know what you said. But we're not going to go there.

DOUG TISDALE: When did I lose control?

NATALIE MENTEN: Centerfold in the newspaper.

DOUG TISDALE: Director Menten, if you would conclude.

NATALIE MENTEN: OK. We're going to ignore Director Williams there. Yes. Flyers, also running an ad-- I'm paying for that out of my own pocket. So I hope to fill the seats and give a early head's up. So excited. And if anybody would like to attend, it's on our public calendar. So feel free to join in. We have complied with Open Sunshine Law. So that's it. Thanks

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Menten. Director Lubow, you are recognized.

JUDY LUBOW: Thank you, Chair. I wanted to raise an issue that was raised to me by a friend of mine about the lack of appropriate fare collection on light rail. And I had actually typed this up. So I'm going to read it. It's only a paragraph, but I thought it was entertaining.

A friend told me about a fare collection problem her adult son told to her. The friend's son works in Lone Tree at a large company. And he hears people regularly bragging about gaming the RTD fare system on the light rail and saving a lot of money. Apparently this is treated like a sport.

One person claimed he saved \$80 in one month. The game occurs this way. The rider doesn't buy a ticket at all, unless a ticket collector comes through. At which time, then they purchase a ticket through the mobile app for the station just before when the conductor came through, saving lots of money, either by not having to buy a ticket at all or buying one at the erroneously reduced price.

There is no reason for this man to make up this story. And I think we should seriously track down the real amount of lost revenue on our light rail trains. And I remember Director Solano, who is no longer with us. But he would say, I ride that thing. I ride it, and I see that there are people who are not paying.

And we would all kind of pooh-pooh it. But I don't think so. And this young man had no reason to lie. So I would really like a staff response to this. And perhaps that it could be talked about at our one of the next meetings. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much, Director Lubow. I am shocked, shocked to hear that there is gambling in this establishment. I'm quoting Casablanca, sorry. It is an issue that deserves

further examination. And I believe that our General Manager has made note of that and intends to follow up and provide the Board with further response in the future. Is that correct?

DAVID GENOVA: Yes, Mr. Chair.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. Director Williams, you are recognized.

KATE WILLIAMS: Thank you, Chair Tisdale. I might need some help on this. But I have a note here that I think, based on discussion that we had earlier today, that I'd like to start proceedings to change the charter of the General Manager's oversight committee. And I don't know how to begin that. So I'm asking for some help here. But I believe that we had some discussion that it might be time to do that.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. I appreciate the opportunity. And I will let General Council respond to that, too should he choose. But I would suggest in the first instance, you could discuss it with the gentleman to your left, who just immediately in the past 30 days got a resolution before the Board, by virtue of three directors signing on. And that's certainly one way to do it.

KATE WILLIAMS: OK. I think that was just kind of my question is, how do I begin to change the charter of the General Manager Oversight Committee? And the answer is I need to draft a resolution, get a minimum of three directors to sign on, and then present it at a Board meeting. Is that correct? OK. Is that correct?

DOUG TISDALE: And General Counsel can now join in.

ROLF ASPHAUG: Yes, this is General Counsel Rolf Asphaug. You said present-- Director Williams, you said present at a Board meeting. And the preference would be to present it to, and then it can be determined whether it's supposed to-- take it to a committee. The preference is to have discussion at a committee and not take something directly to a Board--

KATE WILLIAMS: And which committee would I-- any one? I can pick my own committee? I can pick--

ROLF ASPHAUG: I think we'd have to have some more discussion offline about that, as to what the appropriate committee would be. It depends what the specific issue is.

KATE WILLIAMS: Thank you. OK, I'm good for now. Thank you for that.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you Director Williams. Mr. Secretary, Director Walker, you are recognized.

JEFF WALKER: Thanks. I was reappointed to act as finance committee, in case anybody has any questions about that. Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you for sharing. And one fact I forgot to-- one event that I forgot to highlight and to congratulate all of us was the gathering of elected officials in the Denver Post Auditorium last Friday for discussion relative to the operator shortage and potential service reduction and soliciting input from many elected officials, who came in response to our invitation. Present at that were First Vice Chair Catlin, Second Vice Chair Rivera-Malpiede, Treasurer Cook, Secretary Walker, Director Whitmore, Director Guissinger, and Director Williams, in addition to the Chair-- and Director Menten, of course, I'm sorry. Yeah, we had nine. That's right. So Thank you all very much for being there and being a part of that. And I think it was an important discussion.

Any other new business to come before the Board at this time from any Director? Madam Second Vice Chair, you're recognized.

ANGIE RIVERA-MALPIEDE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I just want to say how honored I am that Senator Bennet has asked me to sit on the Academy Nomination Board again to represent him. This is, like, my fifth year. And these kids are amazing human beings. It's just an honor to be in their presence. And I know, Chair, you're going to be joining me on that committee.

DOUG TISDALE: And for the sake of the record, I actually just finished up. I did mine, I think, a week ago or two weeks ago. And let me second what the Second Vice Chair has said. It is the most inspiring, inspirational day you will ever have talking to these people, #TheFutureIsInGoodHands. Director Guissinger, you are recognized.

LYNN GUISSINGER: It's sort of a question. I don't see it on the calendar. But the meeting with the Northwest Corridor Mayors and Commissioners Coalition is this Friday at 7:30. Is that right, Dave?

DAVID GENOVA: That is correct, at the Louisville Public Library, 7:30 this Friday.

LYNN GUISSINGER: Thank you.

DOUG TISDALE: Thank you very much. Any other new business to come before the Board at this time? All right, then I will advise that we do have contemplated a very brief Executive Session for this evening. And I will give the public a heads up on this. Following the Executive Session, no business will be done by this Board. There will be no business conducted by this Board following the Executive Session, assuming that the Executive Session motion is made and passes.

So let me propose at this time an Executive Session for conference with legal counsel on DTP and RRP litigation matters pursuant to Colorado revised statute section 42-6-402(4)(B) relative to conferences with an attorney for the local public body for the purposes of receiving legal advice on specific legal questions. I will ask for a motion to move into Executive Session for that purpose, as stated herein, and also with the understanding that following the conclusion of the Executive Session that the Board will adjourn. Do I have a motion?

CLAUDIA FOLSKA: So moved

DOUG TISDALE: Where did I hear a motion? Director Folska gave me a motion. And Director Williams gives me a second. Is there any discussion on the motion to move into Executive Session? Does the Board office want an electronic vote? All right, all those in favor of moving into Executive Session, please indicate saying aye.

ALL: Aye

DOUG TISDALE: Are there any opposed? Let the record reflect there was silence. Therefore the motion passes unanimously by more than the 2/3 required. Ladies and gentlemen, please note that we will take a five-minute recess. I say, again, five minutes. Let's say at 7:15 PM. Standard time on Tuesday, the 19th day of--